Journal of Educational Research & Social Sciences Review (JERSSR)

Developing Responsible Elites: A Qualitative Content Analysis of History Textbooks of Elite Schools in Pakistan

1.	**Arjumand Rauf**	PhD Scholar, Department of Education, University of Management and Technology, Lahore Email: f2017095002@umt.edu.pk
2.	**Dr. Yaar Muhammad**	(Corresponding Author) Assistant Professor, Incharge Department of Education, Government College Women University, Sialkot Email: Yaar.muhammad@gcwus.edu.pk
3.	**Dr. Yasira Waqar**	Assistant Professor. Syed Ahsan Ali and Syed Maratib Ali School of Education Email: yasira.waqar@lums.edu.pk

Abstract

Elites in Pakistan play a central role in shaping the civic and political culture of the state. Civic and political sense is largely cultivated by the schools through citizenship education. Through qualitative content analysis, the present study explores how one of the most widely used series of history textbooks in elite schools prepares students for civic and political participation. The results revealed that civic participation was mostly associated with religious teachings, and political participation was confined to wars of succession and the struggle for independence. However, the need to participate in sustainable development was stressed. There is a wide room for the narratives of the textbook to accommodate historical consciousness and multiple-perspectivity so that elite students can broaden the scope of their roles and responsibilities towards the state and could understand the perspective and welcome multitudes in the socio-economic and political spheres of the country.

Keywords: Elites, Civic and Political Participation, Textbooks, History, Content Analysis

Introduction

Nurturing the sense of civic and political engagement of youth is considered crucial for developing countries since civic engagement increases social cohesion and promotes ethical and moral values by serving humanity for a greater cause (Muhammad, 2019). However, political participation and the realization of a democratic society directly relates to political knowledge. For many reasons, as compared to the general masses, elites in Pakistan are in a better position to perform these duties. Pakistan serves as a typical example of an elite state where "a separate social group relishes the privileged position and exercises significant control over the administration of the societal affairs" (Amsden, DiCaprio, & Robinson, 2012, p. 4). Moreover, the aristocracy in Pakistan not only controls a massive amount of wealth and power but is also responsible for policy implementation, shaping the civic and political attitude of the masses, and setting an example for the multitudes to be followed (Bajwa & Ansari, 2018).

Although the task of cultivating a responsible attitude is championed by citizenship education (Muhammad & Brett, 2015), the place of content around citizenship education in textbooks and the school curriculum is the object of fierce debate (Jimenez, Lerch, & Bromley, 2017; Muhammad & Brett, 2017). In the current era where educational institutes are victimized by politics and commercialism, the discourse of the textbook is never solely an even-handed or neutral selection of information, somehow available in front of the pupils (Khokhar & Muhammad, 2020, 2022). Rather, it is always a component of a selective belief or ideology (Apple, 2012). The concept of a legitimate and responsible citizen is built upon the narratives of the textbooks (Muhammad & Brett, 2019, 2020), and content analysis is used to uncover the ideologies presented through these narratives (Muhammad, 2015). Therefore, through content analysis, this study is an attempt to answer the question raised by the geniuses of elitism along with the significance of citizenship education that how well are elites prepared concerning their civic and political roles?

Literature review

The obligation of converting citizens by chance to citizens by choice relies on citizenship education,

as the young generation does not become good citizens by accident (Pirzada, Muhammad, & Zaka, 2021; Zaka & Muhammad, 2021). The government views citizenship education as a tool through which they can align the skills, values, and dispositions of their young generation to the desired direction (Rauf, Muhammad, & Saeed, 2021). It is through citizenship education that students are educated about national values and norms by learning the responsibilities and obligations of being good citizens (Choi, 2016; Diana, Muhammad, & Raauf, 2022). Citizenship education is broadly divided into national identity, civic rights, social, cultural, and supranational belongingness, and civic and political participation (Gagnon & Pagé, 1999). The scope of the present study is limited to civic and political participation.

Lin (2015) includes moral education, service-learning programs, and political simulations in civic and political participation. Biswas (2014) believes that it helps in understanding the approach of values and structure of civic and political culture that subsequently leads to a wish to act beneficially for participants of the society. Civic participation is mostly related to voluntary participation in non-government organizations to work for the betterment of society. It also refers to the participation of citizens in social and public issues (Kwon, Shao, & Nah, 2021). Broadly, civic participation means engaging in political, economic, and social spheres of community spurred by a notion of dedication to the common good (Reichert & Print, 2018). Parallel with civic participation is political participation which is defined as an action that has the impact of influencing government action either directly by affecting the making or implementation of public policy or indirectly by influencing the selection of people who make these policies (Lall, 2014; Verba, Schlozman, & Brady, 1995). It is viewed as a continuously expanding repertoire of activities aiming to defend interests, express opinions in public, and influence the decisions of authorities (Deimel, Hoskins, & Abs, 2020). Participation in the civic and political arena is regulated by requisite skills or lifelong skills and cultivation of the sense of duties and responsibilities (Biswas, 2014; Gagnon & Pagé, 1999; Pontes, Henn, & Griffiths, 2019; Thornton & Jaeger, 2007). Skills are a by-product of the qualification that nationals must get to participate, the motivation that inspires them to contribute, and the information that they must hold to participate successfully (Gagnon & Pagé, 1999). Whereas duties and responsibilities include abiding by the law, working for sustainable development and nurturing the sense of personal accountability (Biswas, 2014; Schank & Rieckmann, 2019; Thornton & Jaeger, 2007).

Although Pakistan was born out of a religious ideology that gives a complete code of life, it remained confused about what kind of skills, values, and dispositions are required by its citizens (Diana et al., 2022; Muhammad, 2019). Citizenship education was used to serve the agenda of governing bodies which remained jumbled between democratic citizens, good Muslims, and enlightened citizens. Consequently, due to a lack of proper planning and the farsightedness of leaders, Pakistan failed to nurture a sense of civic and political participation in its youth (Bilal & Malik, 2014). For instance, Arshad, Hina, and Tariq (2020) reported that democratic practices, the sense of accountability, and civic participation are neglected areas in the Pakistani educational system. In addition, Arshad et al. (2020) claimed that historical facts are presented in a didactic manner leaving no room for critical thinking. Furthermore, Latif (2022) stated that civic education had been dominated by elites to secure their personal and short-term interests. Tariq, Dilawar, and Muhammad (2019) stressed the need for educational reform and progressive pedagogy to make students responsible for civic and political participation.

Currently, civic, and political participation in Pakistan largely revolves around patronage that is guided by army officers, bureaucrats, industrialists, clans, or religious leaders (Lall, 2014). Resource allocation, policymaking, implementation, and governance all lie in the hands of these power dynamics in Pakistan (Ahmed, 2017). Social class is one of the strong variables in comprehending political and civic participation. The complex interplay of socio-economic status. academic programs, and conceptions of equality hold important implications on the way pupils position their characters as citizens, whether they imagine themselves primarily as submissive citizens, community leaders, or campaigners in pursuit of social justice (Sim, 2012). It is important to examine the development of civic and political engagement among young elites because these specific kinds of dispositions are likely to translate into adulthood, which will shape the socio-political landscape of the country (Lin, 2015).

Class structure in Pakistan is also reflective of the stratified educational system, which is divided into public and private schools (Khan, Muhammad, & Masood, 2021). Pedagogies in public

_____

schools of Pakistan are driven by lower-order thinking skills that mostly produce students suitable for mechanical tasks only, whereas elite private schools with excellent teaching-learning facilities can engage students in higher-order thinking skills that could develop a better sense of civic and political responsibilities (Jamil & Muhammad, 2019; Jamil, Muhammad, & Qureshi, 2021). Moreover, it is difficult for students from public schools to understand and act upon the concept of civic participation after suffering from the fears of satisfying the basic requirements of survival. As a result, the present study examines the content of history textbooks taught in elite schools about civic and political involvement, as they are in a better position to transform society.

Methods and Materials

The research in History education has been mostly accommodated by qualitative research methodologies. Under the umbrella of qualitative research, content analysis of the History textbooks was conducted to answer the questions under investigation. The purpose of content analysis is to organize and elicit meaning from the data collected and to draw realistic conclusions from it (Roller, 2019).

Textbooks are one of the major tools that contribute to the country's soft power (Wojciuk, Michałek, & Stormowska, 2015). The content of this multi-billion industry (Swanson, 2014) assists as signifiers of citizenship education and as indexes of identity, status, or value and hence cannot be ignored. The content of textbooks explains how social actors work and, therefore, cannot be confined to the explanation of language or phrases independent of the form and purpose it serves in human activities (Russell & Tiplic, 2014).

A purposive sampling technique was used for the selection of schools, textbooks, and grade levels. Textbook selection involves the choice of relevant texts that serve as the most suitable source of data. History subject was selected because the aims of citizenship education are well aligned with history (Sim, 2012), and also the cultivation of civic and political participation is a norm in social studies classrooms which include history and geography (Klapko, 2018). Literature review guided the selection of elite schools in Pakistan. These privately owned schools are located in a posh area, use English as a medium of instruction, and these educational institutions cost more (than public schools) per student per year (Rahman, 2004; Ramazan, 2015). Moreover, the income in these institutions represents fewer than 1% of the families in Pakistan (Gardezi, 1991; Qadeer, 2006). Grade six, seven, and eight were selected because students of these classes fall under the age group when they acquire a sense of civic rights and responsibilities (Schulz, Ainley, Fraillon, Losito, & Agrusti, 2016). Lin (2015) argued that understanding political and civic engagement at this age is of great significance.

The series of books selected for this study is named *Understanding History* and was written by Ismat Riaz and published by Oxford University Press. This series has three books, which are taught respectively in grades six, seven, and eight of elite schools, and each book comprises exactly ninety-one pages. The first book taught in class six has fifteen chapters starting from early civilizations to the Delhi sultanate. The second book taught in class seven has thirteen chapters covering topics from the decline of the Romans and the rise of Islamic civilization to the fall of the Mughal era and the arrival of the East India Company in the sub-continent. The third and last series tells the history of how Britain took over India, and that ultimately led to the creation of Pakistan in eleven chapters.

The approach developed by Elo and Kyngäs for qualitative content analysis was used in this study (Elo & Kyngäs, 2008). NVivo 12 was used to facilitate the content analysis of the textbooks. The books were scanned, converted into a readable format, and read several times to become familiar with the data. During the first phase, open codes were developed, and in the second phase, similar codes were organized into appropriate categories from the analysis matrix. Categories under areas of participation were civic and political participation, under requisite skills were motivation, qualification, and information, whereas under duties and responsibilities were sustainable development and personal accountability. All the codes in each matrix were synthesized into an integrated result.

Findings

Areas of participation

Broadly the areas of participation are divided into civic and political participation. Civic engagement is directly related to the social capital that undertakes to solve community problems and improve the well-being of the residents and the community in general by volunteering time and money and taking

action to benefit the community (Stefaniak, Bilewicz, & Lewicka, 2017). As the key point of civic participation is voluntary involvement to benefit people and reduce the sufferings of the society, the analyzed textbooks mostly portray religious participation in this aspect as when people "reject the strict control of the Brahmins and the injustice of the caste system. There arose two spiritual Leaders in the sixth century BCE" who preached that "one must stay away from sin and not harm anyone as all creatures in nature such as insects, plants, animals, and human beings could feel pain" (B1, p. 18). As civic participation also refers to implementing a solution to a problem that higher authorities have failed to tackle, the book suggests, "Ashoka was so upset at the sight of bloodshed and destruction that he vowed never to fight again, and eventually became a Buddhist. His attention was then focused on the welfare of his subjects and the promotion of Buddhism. He had many stupas built and called the meeting of the Third Great Buddhist" (B1, p. 24). Unrest and fighting during the Zhou dynasty were also tried to control by the religious preacher Confucius who "gave importance to human values and worship of ancestors" (B1. p. 36).

The concept of civic participation was further elaborated by mentioning the efforts of Sir Syed Ahmed Khan, who "tried to bring about a social reformation among the Muslims who had become frustrated, lazy, and politically downtrodden. He started his famous journal 'Tehzib-ul-Akhlaque' through which he called on the Muslims to shed their conservatism and move to a higher plane of thinking both individually and collectively" Also, the book highlighted that reform and revival of Muslims through education was Sir Syed's foremost concern. In 1859 he set up the first educational institution, called the Farzi Madressa, at Muradabad. In 1864 a similar madrassah was established at Ghaziabad. However, the most important impact was to be felt through the Scientific Society of Ghazipur, founded in 1867, where works of Western arts and sciences were translated into Urdu. In 1875 came his final and long-lasting achievement, the Mohammedan Anglo-Oriental College at Aligarh" (B3, p. 17). The efforts of the civilians Hassan Ali Effendi and Syed Ameer Ali in establishing Sindh Madressa-tul-Islam, Darul-Uloom Deoband, and Nadvat-ul-ulema (B3, p. 20-21) for the educational revival of Muslims and their social uplift during the post-1857 era serves as a good example of civic participation. Civic participation of Muslim women during the struggle for freedom was also mentioned.

The other side of the coin is political participation which influences the decision-making of the governments. The most prominent feature of political participation in the modern era is voting, but since the selected books deal with the time of early civilizations to the creation of Pakistan, it talks less about making influence through voting and more about wars. Among the eleven early civilizations mentioned in the book, it was Greek and Roman civilizations that allowed political participation to its citizens to some extent "Athens became a democracy, and each free citizen could meet in the Assembly forty times in a year and discuss the laws and improvements to the state. The Assembly elected judges and a council of fifty men to carry out the laws made by the citizens. However, women and slaves were not allowed to participate in the Assembly" (B1 p. 44). Whereas in Rome, "The plebeians (common people) also took part in the government through the assemblies and elected people to control the powers of the Senate" (B1, p. 49). Other civilizations deprived their citizens of political participation: Although Qin dynasty "contributed immensely to Chinese progress "but it "did not allow any sort of discussion about the government" (B1, p. 34).

Next to the topic of early civilizations, a detailed account of the Mughal era was narrated. The narration of the political participation of this time was limited to the war of succession and fought between Rajas, Maharajas, Lodhi, Marathas, and other lineages to rule the subcontinent. The one with a mighty heart and ample resources were entitled to govern and influence the policies until it was undertaken and ruled by another, more powerful group. The governing bodies of this time that had power and could influence public decisions or had some opinion in government policies were labeled as Subedar or governor (B2, p. 42), *Mansabdars*, princes of royal blood, nobles (B2, p. 41), sub-kings but directly by the servants of the crown (B2, p. 56) and provincial governors (B2, p. 61). The role of ordinary citizens in politics during this era was not mentioned.

However, a strong illustration of how political participation can influence government decisions was demonstrated by recounting the arrival of the Britishers and the struggle for Pakistan. The books highlighted that British influence started when the "emperor of the sub-continent became used to the ease and luxury of court life and was unable to fight for long periods to put down rebellions. The courtiers, taking advantage of their weakness, intrigued, and plotted" (B2, p. 64), and

"Lord Wellesley (1798-1805) came up with the policy of 'Subsidiary Alliances' to bring Indian states under British control" (B3, p. 4).

The credit for the independence of India and Pakistan is also owned by the political participation and determination of its leaders. When "under pressure from the Indian National Congress, the British Indian government agreed to hold elections in India" (B3, p. 14). or when "the Indian Council Act of 1861 was passed to include 'non-officials of Indian descent on the Viceroy's Executive Council" (B3, p. 13).

Events of the Rowlett Act, 1919, the Jallianwala Bagh tragedy at Amritsar, 1919, the Crawling Order, the Khilafat Movement, 1919-24, the Non-Cooperation Movement of 1920, the Simon Commission of 1927, Civil Disobedience and the Salt March, and the Lahore Resolution of 1940 explain the complete story of the political participation and struggle of thousands of people for their independence.

Requisite Skills

Understanding civic and political processes and a desire to participate in the civic and political arena is not enough. A range of skills is essential to reap the fruits of civic and political life. Qualification, motivation, and information are part of the requisite skills. The analyzed books were completely silent regarding any qualification required by present-day citizens for healthy and active participation. Whereas the historical narratives guide the students that active participation in civic and political life was mostly enjoyed by the people belonging to the ruling class or other nobles or elite members of society.

The motivation behind this participation was mostly by the people who were "ambitious for power" (B1, p. 79) and wanted "to conquer the world and reach its end" (B1, p. 20), "add more territory to…empire" (B1, p. 29) or "gain the wealth of the subcontinent" (B1, p. 62).

Political participation driven by religious motivation was also mentioned when "crusades were fought to win Jerusalem back from the Muslims. Jerusalem is a city that is sacred to the Jews, Christians, and Muslims alike" (B2, p. 13). Aurangzeb's motivation behind ruling the empire was stated: "I was sent into the world by providence to live and labor, not for myself but others, that it is my duty not to think of my happiness except so far as it is inseparably connected with the happiness of my people" (B2, p. 58). motivation behind the civic participation of Sir Syed was to "encourage the Muslims to think creatively and pursue education to improve socially, financially, and spiritually" (B3, p. 16). Other than power and religion, political participation was also guided by the interest to secure identity, as the book underscored this: "The 1940s became the struggle to achieve that identity in the shape of a separate state for the Muslims of India" (B3, p. 75).

Information in citizenship education requires problem-solving, critical thinking, personal development, empowerment, communication, tolerance, and skills of inquiry (Gearon, 2014). To teach these skills, the doctrine of citizenship education cannot be confined to the minimalist continuum; rather, it requires the teaching of multiple perspectives through inclusive, value-based, and interactive participation (Stuurman, 2019). Chapters on early civilization and the Mughal era lacks multi-perspective and an inquiry-based approach; however, the struggle for the independence of Pakistan and India showed slight movement from a single narrative approach to multiple perspectivity. Viewpoints of all three parties—Hindus, Muslims, and Britishers, during the issue of partition of Bengal, failure of the communal award, and round table conferences—were stated. Reasons for the rejection of the Government of India Act were given as: "The Muslim League rejected the Act because it did not give enough autonomy to the Muslims to run their affairs in the provinces. The Congress rejected the Act because it did not give Swaraj or self-rule to Indians, and the British were still in control at the federal level" (B3, p. 57).

Duties and Responsibilities

Personal accountability, respect for the laws, and working for sustainable development are part of duties and responsibilities. The analyzed books were silent about the concept of personal accountability. Not a single king, ruler, prince, or leader was held accountable for what he had done. However, the importance of maintenance of law and order was given due attention. The credit for the rise of the empires was also given to up keeping of law and order: "They did not interfere with the lives of the conquered people if they accepted Rome's rule, obeyed the law, and paid the taxes" (B1, p. 49), and "The maintenance of law and order in the empire (Akbar) was given importance, as it meant stability of the government and security for the people and their work and trade." (B2, p. 66).

_____

Quaid-e-Azam's speech was also quoted to stress law and order: "You will no doubt agree with me that the first duty of a government is to maintain law and order so that the life, property and religious beliefs of its subjects are fully protected by the State" (B3, p. 86). The absence of orderliness was also mentioned as the reason for the fall of empires in the following words: "This period is also known as the Dark Ages, because of the collapse of law and order, and civilized life and the lack of interest in knowledge (B2, p. 2).

UNESCO recognizes sustainable development as an important part of civic education and a responsibility to be fulfilled by the residents of the state. Sustainable development is defined as satisfying human needs, ensuring social justice, and respecting environmental limits (Campbell, Kelly-Weber, & Lavallee, 2020). The most addressed notion was of satisfying human needs, then social justice to some extent, and environmental needs were not mentioned at all in the textbooks. The books provided an interesting account of the development under early civilizations, the Mughal era, and then to British rule. Growth in the areas of arts, science, literature, language, architecture, trade, commerce, philosophy, and even the industrial revolution was mentioned to some extent. It starts from satisfying human needs during ancient civilization: "One of the oldest known universities in the world was at Taxila, and it was the leading learning center" (B1, p. 19), "An advanced system of carrying water, known as a qanat, was developed by the Persians" (B1, p. 41), "The other feature that set the Greeks apart from others in Europe was their learning and education. They were known for their philosophers, scholars, writers, and scientists such as Plato, Socrates, Aristotle, Pythagoras, and Archimedes, who are famous for their knowledge and admired even today (B1, p. 44)", "Another factor for the spread of the Roman Empire was that the Romans built roads across the length and breadth of their empire for their legions to march over." Bait-ul-Hikmah, the House of Wisdom at Baghdad, was set up by the Abbasid Khalifa (B1, p. 58). "To improve agriculture and the life of the peasant, Feroz Tughlaq started irrigation of farmlands by having canals dug" (B1, p. 71). Development under British rule and the industrial revolution was also mentioned: "The laying of railway tracks and setting up a railway system in the subcontinent in 1849 helped the British to transport raw materials and finished products from the source to the ports" (B3, p. 283). "This was made possible by new inventions such as the steam engine, which could power machines to make metal tools, thus helping in producing further machinery for the textile industry and better transportation (B2, p. 80).

Social justice was also mentioned. For instance, books mentioned that "Alauddin was a strict and successful ruler who tried to bring peace and prosperity to this kingdom. He took an active part in running the government and made sure that prices of food items were controlled, taxes were fixed, and the policy of land grants to nobles was revised (B1, p. 70). "Sikander Lodhi worked hard at improving a lot of the common people (B1, p. 73)," Jahangir's sense of justice for all is evident from the chain of justice he put up in Agra" (B2, p. 66) and most importantly, "Ottoman Empire and he was also the first Sultan to codify criminal and constitutional law" (B2, p. 21).

Discussion

The analyzed textbooks provided a detailed account of history from early civilization to the creation of Pakistan. It used a chronological approach rather than a thematic or flashback approach, which is considered more suitable for developing historical consciousness or narrative competence in students and also helps them to develop the ability to link the connections between past and present (Skjæveland, 2017).

Although areas of civic and political participation were mentioned, it was restricted mostly to the ruling elites of society. Hence extremely discriminatory and hegemonic political learning makes its way into history textbooks (Deimel et al., 2020). Civic participation in the textbooks was limited to the preaching and organization of religious thoughts only. Whereas the history of great empires and Indo-Pak was full of examples where people from non-government organizations rose to benefit their society. The Mughal era was not just full of wars; civic participation was also cherished by the people. The building of caravanserai for travelers, digging wells, construction of bridges, and organized distribution of charity, grain, and bread was common during this period (Iftikhar, 2019). The norm of civic participation continues during British rule. The living examples in Lahore are Ganga Ram and Gulab Devi hospitals which are still serving humanity. The books failed to mention any "civic goals" or to develop a sense of "civic responsibility" in present-day students. These findings remained aligned with the previous studies (Arshad et al., 2020; Latif, 2022; Muzaffar, 2020).

Similarly, political participation during the Mughal era, as portrayed by the book, was not limited to governing elites, religious preachers, or Muslim rulers in wars of succession. The bankers-sahukars, and merchants also played a crucial role in the politics of the Mughal era (Chakrabarti, 1982). Indeed, the nature and scale of political participation of non-Muslim groups in Mughal India were unprecedented in the entire history of Islam (Alam, 2001). Secondly, the consequences of wars are not limited to the fact that for one empire to rise, another must fall. Within this falling and rise of empires, there is massive destruction and suffering along with socio-economic change faced by both sides. An account of the demolition and other social changes should be there so that students can develop the sense to judge the worth of ramifications of the political decisions made by the leaders.

The historical topics taught by these textbooks could serve as an excellent source to develop skills required by a pluralistic society, like conflict resolution, communication, and appreciation of diversity. The Mughal state, rather than being a perfect structure at a given point in time, could be understood as a process that incorporated and adjusted to the traditions and customs of the peoples as well as to the regions that were integrated into the empire over the years (Alam, 2001).

Moreover, the Persian, Greek, Roman, Ottoman, and Islamic empires, civilizations, and commonwealths were tri-continental entities situated in the space around the Mediterranean and the Indian Ocean. The versatility and diversity of their religious, social, cultural, and political thoughts require a multi-perspective approach which could help students understand a particular historical event through different interpretations (Wendell, 2018) as compared to the analyzed textbooks in which history is objectively represented by one closed narrative. The books focused on developing passive and apolitical approaches in students who are more likely to make judgments based on characters rather than real issues (Pontes et al., 2019). Teaching through multiple perspectives will broaden the scope of students' motivation to participate in civic and political life and appreciate democratic processes (Kopinska, 2020).

To make students realize their duties and responsibilities towards the states and to become involved in solving problems, they need to have information regarding democratic institutions or other political setups working in their country with their historical imprints. Historical narratives should also develop a sense of accountability, which would allow them to accept the outcomes of their activities without criticizing others when matters go wrong (Biswas, 2014) and will help them in developing the concept of shared fate (Ritter, 2020). The text of the books failed to address such concepts.

The responsibility of working for sustainable development was conveyed to the students. It was clearly expressed that sustainable development at a massive scale is possible only when the ruling bodies themselves are interested or sincere in making advances that meet the needs of the present world without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their own needs (Ideland & Malmberg, 2014). Moreover, through historical narratives of the medieval era and British rule, it was also expressed that the maintenance of law and order is a prerequisite for growth and development.

Conclusion

The official and legitimate narratives of the text that craft the mindset of elite students have a two-fold impact. First, they view their position and interpret their responsibilities which concludes what role is expected from them. Secondly, they also position and fit multitudes within the framework of the text that penetrates their minds. It is almost impossible for the students to exceed the limits and surpass the shaped boundaries of performance for both classes. Human history is a history not only of wars and being dominant over others but also of sacrifice, courage, and kindness. What we choose to emphasize in this complex history will determine our lives and the future of coming generations. Nonetheless, the current narrative offers students a constrained view where the roles of many segments of society are not reflected. At present, the text is limited in civic information and fails to impart political mindfulness to the students. This objective presentation of historical narratives develops a myopic attitude and insensitivity towards many socio-economic and political arenas. Therefore, we need to build the capacity of power elites that is influenced by skill, inclusive attitude, strong will, and social responsibility to work for the interest of the country (Bajwa & Ansari, 2018). To achieve this goal, along with the focus on historical thinking and reasoning, producing and refining the historical consciousness of students and emphasizing the multi-perspectivity of education have become more significant in history education (Sakki & Pirttilä-Backman, 2019).

References

Alam, M. (2001). *The crisis of empire in Mughal North India: Awadh and the Punjab, 1707-1748* (2nd ed.). Delhi: Oxford University Press.

Amsden, A. H., DiCaprio, A., & Robinson, J. A. (2012). *The role of elites in economic development*. United Kingdom: Oxford University Press.

Apple, M. W. (2012). *Knowledge, power, and education: The selected works of Michael W. Apple*. New York: Routledge.

Arshad, A. M., Hina, K., & Tariq, T. M. (2020). Inclusion of civic education in social studies subject at primary level in AJK: A Perspective Study. *Research Journal of Social Sciences and Economics Review, 1*(4), 282-288.

Bajwa, F., & Ansari, S. H. (2018). Understanding the hidden power relations in policy implementation: The case of Pakistan. *ISSRA Papers, 10*(2), 1-16.

Bilal, A., & Malik, R. (2014). Citizenship Education in Pakistan. *Developing Country Studies, 16*(4), 19-26.

Biswas, A. E. (2014). Lessons in citizenship: Using collaboration in the classroom to build community, foster academic integrity, and model civic responsibility. *Journal on Excellence in College Teaching, 25*(1), 9-25.

Campbell, A. C., Kelly-Weber, E., & Lavallee, C. (2020). University teaching and citizenship education as sustainable development in Ghana and Nigeria: insight from international scholarship program alumni. *Higher Education, 81*, 129–144. doi:https://doi.org/10.1007/s10734-019-00484-3

Chakrabarti, P. N. (1982). *Some aspects of political participation of Indian merchants in Mughal India.* Paper presented at the Proceedings of the Indian History Congress.

Choi, M. (2016). A concept analysis of digital citizenship for democratic citizenship education in the internet age. *Theory & research in social education, 44*(4), 565-607.

Deimel, D., Hoskins, B., & Abs, H. J. (2020). How do schools affect inequalities in political participation: compensation of social disadvantage or provision of differential access? *Educational Psychology, 40*(2), 146-166.

Diana, N. K., Muhammad, Y., & Raauf, A. (2022). Perception of national identity: An interview study of teachers in Gilgit Baltistan. *Journal of Educational Research & Social Sciences Review, 2*(2), 92-98.

Elo, S., & Kyngäs, H. (2008). The qualitative content analysis process. *Journal of advanced nursing, 62*(1), 107-115.

Gagnon, F., & Pagé, M. (1999). Conceptual framework for an analysis of citizenship in the liberal democracies. Retrieved from https://citeseerx.ist.psu.edu/viewdoc/download?doi=10.1.1.575.8298&rep=rep1&type=pdf

Gardezi, H. N. (1991). *A reexamination of the socio-political history of pakistan: Reproduction of class relations and ideology*: Edwin Mellen Press.

Gearon, L. (2014). *Learning to teach citizenship in the secondary school: a companion to school experience*. New York: Routledge.

Ideland, M., & Malmberg, C. (2014). 'Our common world'belongs to 'Us': constructions of otherness in education for sustainable development. *Critical studies in Education, 55*(3), 369-386.

Iftikhar, R. (2019). Genesis of muslim culture and co-existence in Mughal era. *The Journal of Islamic Thought and Civilization, 9*(1), 119-130.

Jamil, M., & Muhammad, Y. (2019). Teaching science students to think critically: Understanding secondary school teachers' practices. *Journal of Research and Reflections in Education, 13*(2), 256-272.

Jamil, M., Muhammad, Y., & Qureshi, N. (2021). Secondary school science teachers' practices for the development of critical thinking skills: An observational study. *Journal of Development and Social Sciences, 2*(4), 259-265. doi:doi:10.47205/jdss.2021(2-IV)22

Jimenez, J. D., Lerch, J., & Bromley, P. (2017). Education for global citizenship and sustainable development in social science textbooks. *European Journal of Education, 52*(4), 460-476.

Khan, I., Muhammad, Y., & Masood, S. (2021). Teaching values to students for their holistic development: An analysis of secondary school teachers' beliefs. *VFAST Transactions on Islamic Research, 9*(3), 90- 99.

Khokhar, A. J., & Muhammad, Y. (2020). Islamic habitus in English language textbooks produced by boards in Pakistan *The Journal of Islamic Thought and Civilization, 10*(1), 288–310.

Khokhar, A. J., & Muhammad, Y. (2022). An imagined space with an imagined time: Analysis of English language textbooks used in state schools in Pakistan. *Citizenship Teaching & Learning, 17*(2), 227–247.

Klapko, D. (2018). *The Use of the Analysis of Discourse in the Process of Evaluation of History Textbooks*. Paper presented at the Local, National and Transnational Identities in Textbooks and Educational Media, Santiago de Compostela. IARTEMpaperdiscourseanalysesof textbooks%20(1).pdf

Kopinska, V. (2020). Student participation in the discourse of Polish citizenship education textbooks for upper secondary school. *Journal of Social Science Education, 19*(1), 172-187.

Kwon, K. H., Shao, C., & Nah, S. (2021). Localized social media and civic life: Motivations, trust, and civic participation in local community contexts. *Journal of Information Technology & Politics, 18*(1), 55-69.

Lall, M. (2014). Engaging the youth–citizenship and political participation in Pakistan. *Commonwealth & Comparative Politics, 52*(4), 535-562.

Latif, T. (2022). *Civic and ethnic nationalism in Pakistan.* (Doctor of Philosophy), University of Canterbury, Retrieved from https://ir.canterbury.ac.nz/handle/10092/104998

Lin, A. (2015). Citizenship education in American schools and its role in developing civic engagement: A review of the research. *Educational Review, 67*(1), 35-63.

Muhammad, Y. (2015). *Pakistani national identity, cultural diversity and global perspective: A policy trajectory study of the national curriculum for secondary school Pakistan Studies in Punjab.* (Unpublished doctoral dissertation), University of Tasmania, Tasmania.

Muhammad, Y. (2019). Pakistani national identity, curriculum reform and citizenship education textbooks: Understanding teachers' perspectives. *Journal of Research & Reflections in Education, 13*(1), 103-122.

Muhammad, Y., & Brett, P. (2015). Beyond binary discourses? Pakistan studies textbooks and representations of cultural, national, and global Identity. *IARTEM e-Journal*(Special Issue Dec.), 74-100.

Muhammad, Y., & Brett, P. (2017). Some challenges in teaching citizenship in an Islamic context: Pakistan Studies teachers' perspectives and practices in relation to teaching about Identity. *Citizenship Teaching and Learning, 12*(3), 279–298.

Muhammad, Y., & Brett, P. (2019). Addressing social justice and cultural identity in Pakistani education: A qualitative content analysis of curriculum policy. In *Education, ethnicity and equity in the multilingual asian context* (pp. 235-253). New York: Springer.

Muhammad, Y., & Brett, P. (2020). Infusing cultural diversity into Pakistan Studies textbooks: An analysis of textbooks and teachers' perspectives. In M. S. Pervez (Ed.), *Radicalization in Pakistan: A Critical Perspective* (pp. 61-76). London: Routledge.

Muzaffar, M. (2020). Political Awareness in Educational Policies of Pakistan: A Historical Review *Journal of Political Studies, 27*(1), 257-273.

Pirzada, G., Muhammad, Y., & Zaka, S. (2021). Engaging instructions in history classrooms: Exploring university teachers' perceptions and practices. *Global Social Sciences Review, 6*(3), 38–48.

Pontes, A. I., Henn, M., & Griffiths, M. D. (2019). Youth political (dis) engagement and the need for citizenship education: Encouraging young people's civic and political participation through the curriculum. *Education, Citizenship and Social Justice, 14*(1), 3-21.

Qadeer, M. (2006). *Pakistan-social and cultural transformations in a Muslim Nation*. New York: Routledge.

Rahman, T. (2004). Denizens of alien worlds: A survey of students and teachers at Pakistan's Urdu and English language-medium schools, and madrassas. *Contemporary South Asia, 13*(3), 307-326.

Ramazan, M. (2015). *Defining characteristics of an elite private school in the context of Karachi*. The Agha Khan University. Retrieved from https://ecommons.aku.edu/theses_dissertations/662/

_____

Rauf, A., Muhammad, Y., & Saeed, A. (2021). Citizenship rights and responsibilities in history textbooks of elite schools in Pakistan: A qualitative content analysis. *Journal of the Research Society of Pakistan, 58*(2), 235-246.

Reichert, F., & Print, M. (2018). Civic participation of high school students: The effect of civic learning in school. *Educational Review, 70*(3), 318-341.

Ritter, M. J. (2020). Civility and shared fate: Social studies teaching as teaching for belonging. *Journal of Curriculum Studies Research, 2*(1), 1-15.

Roller, M. R. (2019). A quality approach to qualitative content analysis: Similarities and differences compared to other qualitative methods. *Forum Qualitative Sozialforschung/Forum: Qualitative Social Research, 20*(3). doi: https://doi.org/10.17169/fqs-20.3.3385

Russell, S. G., & Tiplic, D. (2014). Rights-based education and conflict: A cross-national study of rights discourse in textbooks. *Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education, 44*(3), 314-334.

Sakki, I., & Pirttilä-Backman, A.-M. (2019). Aims in teaching history and their epistemic correlates: a study of history teachers in ten countries. *Pedagogy, Culture & Society, 27*(1), 65-85.

Schank, C., & Rieckmann, M. (2019). Socio-economically substantiated education for sustainable development: development of competencies and value orientations between individual responsibility and structural transformation. *Journal of Education for Sustainable Development, 13*(1), 67-91.

Schulz, W., Ainley, J., Fraillon, J., Losito, B., & Agrusti, G. (2016). *IEA international civic and citizenship education study 2016 assessment framework*. Amsterdam: Springer Nature.

Sim, J. B.-Y. (2012). The burden of responsibility: Elite students' understandings of civic participation in Singapore. *Educational Review, 64*(2), 195-210.

Skjæveland, Y. (2017). Learning history in early childhood: Teaching methods and children's understanding. *Contemporary Issues in Early Childhood, 18*(1), 8-22.

Stefaniak, A., Bilewicz, M., & Lewicka, M. (2017). The merits of teaching local history: Increased place attachment enhances civic engagement and social trust. *Journal of environmental psychology, 51*(1), 217-225.

Stuurman, S. (2019). Concluding observations: citizenship in cities, states and empires. *Citizenship Studies, 23*(3), 277-294.

Tariq, B., Dilawar, M., & Muhammad, Y. (2019). Innovative teaching and technology integration: Exploring elderly teachers' attitudes. *International Journal of Distance Education and E-Learning, 5*(I), 1-16.

Thornton, C. H., & Jaeger, A. J. (2007). A new context for understanding civic responsibility: Relating culture to action at a research university. *Research in Higher Education, 48*(8), 993-1020.

Verba, S., Schlozman, K. L., & Brady, H. E. (1995). *Voice and equality: Civic voluntarism in American politics*. MA: Harvard University Press.

Wendell, J. (2018). History teaching between multiperspectivity and a shared line of reasoning. *Nordidactica. Journal of Humanities and Social Science Education, 8*(4), 136-159.

Wojciuk, A., Michałek, M., & Stormowska, M. (2015). Education as a source and tool of soft power in international relations. *European Political Science, 14*(3), 298-317. doi:10.1057/eps.2015.25

Zaka, S., & Muhammad, Y. (2021). Instructional effectiveness in history classrooms: An analysis of students' perceptions of instructional practices of university teachers. *International Journal of Innovation in Teaching and Learning, 7*(1), 39-62.